September 26, 2016

Ms. Katie Lentz
Open Records
Williamson County Sheriff's Office
508 South Rock Street
Georgetown, Texas 78626

Dear Ms. Lentz:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 627689.

The Williamson County Sheriff’s Office (the “sheriff’s office”) received a request for certified copies of all records pertaining to the requestor’s client. You claim portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.152 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses chapter 411 of the Government Code, which makes confidential criminal history record information (“CHRI”) generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. See id. § 411.083(a). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual laws with respect to the CHRI it generates. See id. Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except that DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F, or subchapter E-1 of the Government Code. See
Gov't Code § 411.083(a). Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. Id. § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. See generally id. §§ 411.090-.127. Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411, subchapter F, of the Government Code. Upon review, we find the Federal Bureau of Investigation ("FBI") number you have marked consist of CHRI that is confidential under section 411.083. Thus, the sheriff’s office must withhold the FBI number you have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code and federal law.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by other statutes such as section 58.007 of the Family Code, which provides, in pertinent part, as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). For purposes of section 58.007(c), a "child" means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age when the conduct occurred. Id. § 51.02(2). Upon review, we find a portion of the submitted information involves alleged delinquent conduct that occurred after September 1, 1997. See id. § 51.03(a) (defining "delinquent conduct"). It does not appear any of the exceptions in section 58.007 apply. Therefore, the sheriff’s office must withhold the information you marked under
section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.¹

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in part, as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Id. § 261.201(a). You contend the information you marked relates to an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect conducted by the sheriff’s office. However, we are unable to determine the age of the victim listed in the information at issue. See id. §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Accordingly, we must rule in the alternative. If the information at issue involves a victim who was under eighteen years of age at the time of the incident at issue, then the information is subject to section 261.201 of the Family Code. In that instance, as you do not indicate the sheriff’s office has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information, the sheriff’s office must withhold the information you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. See Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute). However, if the information at issue does not involve a victim of alleged abuse or neglect who was under eighteen years of age at the time of the incident at issue, then the information is not subject to section 261.201 of the Family Code and the sheriff’s office may not withhold the information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. In that instance, we will consider the applicability of other exceptions to disclosure of the information at issue.

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of the this information.
Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by section 560.003 of the Government Code. Section 560.003 provides that “[a] biometric identifier in the possession of a governmental body is exempt from disclosure under [the Act].” Gov’t Code § 560.003; see also id. §§ 560.001(1) (defining “biometric identifier” to include fingerprints), .002(1)(A) (governmental body may not sell, lease, or otherwise disclose individual’s biometric identifier to another person unless individual consents to disclosure). Therefore, the sheriff’s office must withhold the fingerprint and hand prints we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. See id. § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. See id. § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested). You state the information you marked relates to closed criminal cases that did not result in convictions or deferred adjudications. Based on your representation and our review, we agree section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to the information at issue.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Id. § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). See also Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of the basic information, the sheriff’s office may withhold the information you marked under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd., 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. Id. at 682. In considering whether a public citizen’s date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court’s rationale in Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). Paxton v. City of Dallas, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees’ dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees’ privacy
interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.\textsuperscript{2} \textit{Texas
Comptroller}, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on \textit{Texas Comptroller}, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens’ dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. \textit{City of Dallas}, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3. Thus, the sheriff’s office must withhold the dates of birth of public citizens you marked in the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. \textit{See Gov’t Code} § 552.130. Accordingly, the sheriff’s office must withhold the motor vehicle record information you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

You seek to withhold the identifying information of an undercover deputy from the remaining information under section 552.152 of the Government Code. Section 552.152 provides,

\begin{quote}
Information in the custody of a governmental body that relates to an employee or officer of the governmental body is excepted from [required public disclosure] if, under the specific circumstances pertaining to the employee or officer, disclosure of the information would subject the employee or officer to a substantial threat of physical harm.
\end{quote}

\textit{Id.} § 552.152. You represent the release of the undercover deputy’s identity would subject the deputy to a substantial threat of physical harm. Therefore, we find section 552.152 is applicable to the identity of the undercover deputy within the information at issue. Accordingly, the sheriff’s office must withhold the identifying information of the undercover deputy, which you have marked, under section 552.152 of the Government Code.

In summary, the sheriff’s office must withhold the FBI number you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code and federal law. The sheriff’s office must withhold the information you have marked in under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. If the information at issue involves a victim who was under eighteen years of age at the time of the incident at issue, the sheriff’s office must withhold the information you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. The sheriff’s office must withhold the fingerprint and hand prints we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code

\textsuperscript{2}Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure “information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy.” \textit{Gov’t Code} § 552.102(a).
in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code. With the exception of the basic information, the sheriff's office may withhold the information you marked under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must withhold the information you marked in the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must withhold the identifying information of the undercover deputy, which you have marked, under section 552.152 of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must release the remaining information. 3

Finally, you ask this office to issue a previous determination permitting the sheriff's office to withhold dates of birth of members of the public under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy without seeking a ruling from this office. See id. § 552.301(a) (allowing governmental body to withhold information subject to previous determination); Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001) (listing elements of second type of previous determination under section 552.301(a) of the Government Code). After due consideration, we have decided to grant your request on this matter. Therefore, this letter authorizes the sheriff's office to withhold the dates of birth of public citizens under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. We note common-law privacy is a personal right that lapses at an individual's death. See Moore v. Charles B. Pierce Film Enters., Inc., 589 S.W.2d 489, 491 (Tex. Civ. App.—Texarkana 1979, writ ref'd n.r.e.); see also Open Records Decision Nos. 620 (1993), 272 (1981), 192 (1978). Therefore, this previous determination authorizes the sheriff's office to withhold dates of birth of living individuals. This previous determination is not applicable to dates of birth belonging to deceased individuals. We also note a person or a person's authorized representative has a special right of access under section 552.023 of the Government Code to information that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect the person's privacy interests. See Gov't Code § 552.023(a); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning himself). Therefore, this previous determination is not applicable to dates of birth requested by a person or the authorized representative of a person whose date of birth is at issue. Furthermore, information filed with a court is not protected by common-law privacy. See Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(17); Star-Telegram v. Walker, 834 S.W.2d 54 (Tex. 1992) (common-law privacy not applicable to court-filed document). Accordingly, this previous determination is not applicable to dates of birth contained in court-filed documents. So long as the elements of law, fact, and circumstances do not

---

3 We note the requestor has a right of access to some of the information being released in this instance. See Gov't Code § 552.023(a) (governmental body may not deny access to person to whom information relates or person's agent on ground that information is considered confidential by privacy principles); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). Thus, if the sheriff's office receives another request for the same information from a different requestor, the sheriff's office must again seek a decision from this office.
change so as to no longer support the findings set forth above, the sheriff’s office need not ask for a decision from this office again with respect to this type of information. See ORD 673 at 7-8 (listing elements of second type of previous determination under Gov’t Code § 552.301(a)).

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Matthew Taylor
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MHT/dls

Ref: ID# 627689

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)