



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

September 22, 2016

Mr. Randall Miller
Assistant District Attorney
Civil Division
County of Dallas
411 Elm Street, 5th Floor
Dallas, Texas 75202

OR2016-21363

Dear Mr. Miller:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 627561.

The Dallas County Medical Examiner's Office (the "medical examiner's office") received a request for all documents related to a specified case.¹ You state the medical examiner's office does not maintain certain information the requestor seeks, including an autopsy report or autopsy photographs.² You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure

¹You state the medical examiner's office received clarification of the information requested. *See* Gov't Code § 552.222 (providing if request for information is unclear, governmental body may ask requestor to clarify request); *see also* *City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 304 S.W.3d 380, 387 (Tex. 2010) (holding that when a governmental entity, acting in good faith, requests clarification or narrowing of an unclear or overbroad request for information, the ten-day period to request an attorney general ruling is measured from the date the request is clarified or narrowed).

²The Act does not require a governmental body that receives a request for information to create information that did not exist when the request was received. *See Econ. Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266 (Tex. Civ. App.—San Antonio 1978, writ dismissed); Open Records Decision Nos. 605 at 2 (1992), 563 at 8 (1990), 555 at 1-2 (1990), 452 at 3 (1986), 362 at 2 (1983).

under section 552.108 of the Government Code.³ We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note some of the submitted information is subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a) provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following categories of information are public information and not excepted from required disclosure unless made confidential under this chapter or other law:

...

(3) information in an account, voucher, or contract relating to the receipt or expenditure of public or other funds by a governmental body[.]

Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(3). The submitted information includes information in an account, contract, or voucher relating to the receipt or expenditure of funds by the medical examiner's office that is subject to section 552.022(a)(3). This information, which we have marked, must be released unless it is made confidential under the Act or other law. *See id.* You seek to withhold the information subject to section 552.022(a)(3) under section 552.108 of the Government Code. However, section 552.108 is discretionary in nature and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to Gov't Code § 552.108 subject to waiver). Therefore, the information subject to section 552.022(a)(3) may not be withheld under section 552.108 of the Government Code. However, because section 552.136 of the Government Code makes information confidential under the Act, we will consider the applicability of section 552.136 for the information at issue.⁴ We will also consider your argument under section 552.108 for the information not subject to section 552.022.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code provides, "Notwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected,

³We note, and you acknowledge, the medical examiner's office did not comply with section 552.301 of the Government Code in requesting a ruling from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(b), (e). Nonetheless, because third-party interests can provide a compelling reason to overcome the presumption of openness, we will consider the submitted argument against release of the submitted information. *See id.* §§ 552.007, .302, .352; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 586 at 3 (1991) (claim of another governmental body under statutory predecessor to section 552.108 can provide compelling reason for non-disclosure).

⁴The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.” Gov’t Code § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining “access device”). Accordingly, the medical examiner’s office must withhold the routing and bank account numbers we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). Section 552.108 may be invoked by the proper custodian of information relating to a pending investigation or prosecution of criminal conduct. *See Open Records Decision No. 474 at 4-5 (1987)*. Where a non-law enforcement agency has custody of information that would otherwise qualify for exception under section 552.108 as information relating to the pending case of a law enforcement agency, the custodian of the records may withhold the information if it provides this office with a demonstration the information relates to the pending case and a representation from the law enforcement agency that it wishes to have the information withheld.

You state, and provide a statement demonstrating, the Fannin County Criminal District Attorney’s Office (the “district attorney’s office”) has advised the medical examiner’s office the submitted information is related to an active criminal investigation. The district attorney’s office states it objects to disclosure of the information at issue because its release would interfere with the investigation. Based on these representations, we conclude the medical examiner’s office may withhold the information not subject to section 552.022(a)(3) of the Government Code under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code on behalf of the district attorney’s office. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976).

In summary, the medical examiner’s office must release the information we marked pursuant to section 552.022(a)(3) of the Government Code; however, in releasing this information, the medical examiner’s office must withhold the routing and bank account numbers we marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The medical examiner’s office may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code on behalf of the district attorney’s office.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Claire Morris Sloan". The signature is fluid and cursive, with a long horizontal stroke extending to the right.

Claire V. Morris Sloan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CVMS/som

Ref: ID# 627561

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)