



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

September 14, 2016

Ms. Elizabeth Conry Davidson
Counsel for the Bexar Appraisal District
Elizabeth Conry Davidson Attorney at Law
926 Chulie Drive
San Antonio, Texas 78216

OR2016-20787

Dear Ms. Davidson:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 626119 (PIA# 5925).

The Bexar Appraisal District (the "district"), which you represent, received a request for evidence presented at 2016 appraisal review board hearings pertaining to a specified property owner. You state the district is releasing some of the requested information. You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.149 of the Government Code. You also state release of some of the information may implicate the proprietary interests of CBRE– Valuation & Advisory Service ("CBRE"). Accordingly, you state, and provide documentation showing, you notified the third party of the district's receipt of the request for information and of its right to submit arguments to this office as to why the requested information should not be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 542 at 3 (1990) (statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception in the Act in certain circumstances). We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

¹We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

An interested third party is allowed ten business days after the date of its receipt of the governmental body's notice under section 552.305(d) to submit its reasons, if any, as to why information relating to that party should be withheld from public disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d)(2)(B). As of the date of this letter, we have not received comments from CBRE explaining why the information at issue should not be released. Therefore, we have no basis to conclude CBRE has a protected proprietary interest in the submitted information. *See id.* § 552.110; Open Records Decision Nos. 661 at 5-6 (1999) (to prevent disclosure of commercial or financial information, party must show by specific factual evidence, not conclusory or generalized allegations, that release of requested information would cause that party substantial competitive harm), 552 at 5 (1990) (party must establish *prima facie* case that information is trade secret), 542 at 3. However, we will consider your arguments under sections 552.101 and 552.149 of the Government Code.

Section 552.149 of the Government Code provides, in relevant part:

(a) Information relating to real property sales prices, descriptions, characteristics, and other related information received from a private entity by the comptroller or the chief appraiser of an appraisal district under Chapter 6, Tax Code, is excepted from the requirements of [the Act].

(b) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), the property owner or the owner's agent may, on request, obtain from the chief appraiser of the applicable appraisal district a copy of each item of information described by Section 41.461(a)(2), Tax Code, and a copy of each item of information that the chief appraiser took into consideration but does not plan to introduce at the hearing on the protest. In addition, the property owner or agent may, on request, obtain from the chief appraiser comparable sales data from a reasonable number of sales that is relevant to any matter to be determined by the appraisal review board at the hearing on the property owner's protest[.]

Gov't Code § 552.149(a)-(b). Subsections 552.149(a) and (b) are limited to those counties having a population of 50,000 or more. *Id.* § 552.149(e). We understand Bexar County has a population of 50,000 or more. You state the information attached as Exhibit B consists of information related to real property sales, descriptions, and characteristics, and it was obtained from a private entity. You state there is no pending or upcoming protest hearing before the appraisal review board related to the property listed in the submitted information. Accordingly, the information at issue does not contain information to which the requestor has a right of access pursuant to section 552.149(b). *See id.* § 552.149(b). Based on your representations and our review, we find the district must withhold the information submitted as Exhibit B under section 552.149(a) of the Government Code.²

²As our ruling is dispositive, we do not address the remaining argument against disclosure.

However, we note the remaining information may be protected by copyright. A custodian of public records must comply with the copyright law and is not required to furnish copies of records that are copyrighted. Open Records Decision No. 180 at 3 (1977). A governmental body must allow inspection of copyrighted materials unless an exception applies to the information. *Id.*; see Open Records Decision No. 109 (1975). If a member of the public wishes to make copies of copyrighted materials, the person must do so unassisted by the governmental body. In making copies, the member of the public assumes the duty of compliance with the copyright law and the risk of a copyright infringement suit.

In summary, the district must withhold Exhibit B under section 552.149(a) of the Government Code. The district must release the remaining information; however, any information subject to copyright may only be released in accordance with copyright law.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Erin Groff". The signature is fluid and cursive, with the first name "Erin" and last name "Groff" clearly distinguishable.

Erin Groff
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

EMB/eb

Ref: ID# 626119

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)