



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

August 15, 2016

Ms. Rhonda Modisette  
Records Supervisor  
City of Nacogdoches  
P.O. Drawer 635030  
Nacogdoches, Texas 75963-5030

OR2016-18422

Dear Ms. Modisette:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 628338.

The Nacogdoches Police Department (the "department") received a request for all information pertaining to nine named individuals. You claim the requested information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim.

Initially, we must address the department's obligations under section 552.301 of the Government Code. Pursuant to section 552.301(b), a governmental body must ask for a decision from this office and state the exceptions that apply not later than the tenth business day after the date of receiving the written request. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(b). You state the department received the request for information on July 6, 2016. Thus, the department's ten-business-day deadline was July 20, 2016. The envelope in which the department sent its request for a ruling is post-marked July 22, 2016. *See id.* § 552.308 (describing rules for calculating submission dates of documents sent via first class United States mail, common or contract carrier, or interagency mail). Consequently, the department failed to comply with the requirements of section 552.301(b) of the Government Code.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the

information is public and must be released unless a governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information to overcome this presumption. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ); Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). Generally, a compelling reason to withhold information exists where some other source of law makes the information confidential or where third-party interests are at stake. *See* Open Records Decision No. 150 at 2 (1977). We note section 552.108 of the Government Code is discretionary in nature. This exception serves only to protect a governmental body's interests, and may be waived; as such, it does not constitute a compelling reason to withhold information for purposes of section 552.302. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions in general), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). Thus, no portion of the submitted information may be withheld under section 552.108. However, we note the requested information may be subject to section 552.101 of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup> Because section 552.101 can provide a compelling reason to overcome the presumption of openness, we will address the applicability of section 552.101 to the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. This office has found a compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

The present request seeks unspecified law enforcement records pertaining to the named individuals. This request requires the department to compile the named individuals' criminal histories and implicates the named individuals' right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records listing the named individuals as suspects,

---

<sup>1</sup>The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

arrestees, or criminal defendants, the department must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Britni Ramirez  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

BR/bhf

Ref: ID# 628338

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)