



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

August 2, 2016

Ms. Andrea D. Russell
Counsel for the City of Saginaw
Taylor, Olson, Adkins, Sralla, Elam, L.L.P.
I-30 at Bryant Irvin Road
6000 Western Place, Suite 200
Fort Worth, Texas 76107

OR2016-17346

Dear Ms. Russell:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 620849.

The City of Saginaw (the "city"), which you represent, received a request for all records pertaining to a specified incident. You state the city is withholding motor vehicle record information pursuant to section 552.130(c) of the Government Code and social security numbers pursuant to section 552.147(b) of the Government Code.¹ You further state the city is withholding certain information pursuant to Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009).² You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

¹Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in section 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e). Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See id.* § 552.147(b).

²Open Records Decision No. 684 is a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold certain information without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 48.101 of the Human Resources Code, which pertains to the disclosure of reports of abuse, neglect, or exploitation of elderly and disabled persons in certain facilities. Section 48.101 provides, in pertinent part:

(a) The following information is confidential and not subject to disclosure under [the Act]:

- (1) a report of abuse, neglect, or exploitation made under this chapter;
- (2) the identity of the person making the report; and
- (3) except as provided by this section, all files, reports, records, communications, and working papers used or developed in an investigation made under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

(b) Confidential information may be disclosed only for a purpose consistent with this chapter and as provided by [the Texas Department of Family and Protective Services (the “DFPS”)] or investigating state agency rule and applicable federal law.

Hum. Res. Code § 48.101(a), (b). Section 48.051 of the Human Resources Code provides “a person having cause to believe that an elderly or disabled person is in the state of abuse, neglect, or exploitation” shall report certain prescribed information to the DFPS or another appropriate state agency. *See id.* § 48.051(a). The only entities authorized to conduct an investigation under chapter 48 of the Human Resources Code are DFPS and certain other state agencies, depending on the circumstances surrounding the incident. *See id.* §§ 48.151, .152, .252, .301. Thus, reports made by the city’s police department (the “department”) generally are not subject to section 48.101. The information at issue was created by the department in connection with a criminal investigation conducted by the department. Therefore, we find you have failed to demonstrate the information at issue pertains to an investigation conducted by an entity authorized to conduct such an investigation under chapter 48. Accordingly, the city may not withhold the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 48.101 of the Human Resources Code.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706, 710 (Tex. 1977). You state the

submitted information relates to a pending criminal prosecution. Based upon this representation, we conclude the release of the submitted information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177, 186-87 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559, 560-61 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the submitted information.

However, section 552.108(a)(1) does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-87; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). We note basic information does not include dates of birth. *See* ORD 127 at 3-4. Accordingly, with the exception of basic information, the city may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

We note some of the basic information is subject to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Upon review, we find the information we have marked satisfies the standard established by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, in releasing the basic information, the city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, upon review, we find you have failed to demonstrate any portion of the remaining basic information is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public interest. Therefore, the city may not withhold any portion of the remaining basic information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, with the exception of basic information, the city may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. In releasing the basic information, the city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Cole Hutchison". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Cole Hutchison
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CH/bhf

Ref: ID# 620849

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)