



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

April 28, 2016

Ms. Michelle Buendia
Assistant City Attorney
Criminal Law and Police Section
City of Dallas
1400 South Lamar
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2016-09655

Dear Ms. Buendia:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 607664 (Dallas ORR# 2016-01829).

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received a request for information concerning a specified investigation. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.117, and 552.130 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses laws that make criminal history record information ("CHRI") confidential. CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7

¹The department acknowledges it did not comply with the requirements of section 552.301 of the Government Code in asking this office for a ruling; however, these exceptions provide compelling reasons against disclosure of the requested information. See Gov't Code §§ 552.301, .302. Accordingly, we will consider the applicability of these exceptions to disclosure.

(1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* at 10–12. Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F or subchapter E-1 of the Government Code. *See Gov’t Code* § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) of the Government Code authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for criminal justice purposes. *See id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090–.127. Upon review, none of the submitted information consists of confidential CHRI. Accordingly, the department may not withhold any of the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 261.201(a) of the Family Code, which provides:

(a) Except as provided by Section 261.203, the following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). You explain the submitted information was used or developed in an investigation of alleged child abuse or neglect. *See id.* § 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code); *see also id.* § 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of chapter 261). You have not indicated the department has adopted a rule governing the release of this type of information. Therefore, we assume no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, the submitted information is generally confidential under section 261.201 of the Family Code. In this instance, however, the requestor is a representative of the Texas Department of Family and Protective Services (“DFPS”). Section 261.105(a) provides “[a]ll reports received by a local or state law enforcement agency that allege abuse or neglect by a person responsible for a child’s care, custody, or welfare shall be referred immediately to [DFPS].” *See id.* § 261.105(a). In this instance, the submitted information indicates the individual suspected of child abuse and neglect was responsible for the child’s care, custody, or welfare. *See id.* § 261.001(5)(B)

(person responsible for child's care, custody, or welfare includes a member of the child's family or household as defined by chapter 71 of the Family Code); *see also id.* § 71.005 (household is a unit composed of persons living together in the same dwelling, without regard to whether they are related to each other). Accordingly, section 261.105(a) is applicable, and the confidentiality of section 261.201(a) does not apply in this instance. *See* Attorney General Opinion No. GA-0879 (2011) (law enforcement agency is required to furnish information about alleged child abuse or neglect by person responsible for child's care, custody, or welfare to DFPS). Therefore, the department may not withhold any of the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. Additionally, we note a statutory right of access prevails over a claim under common-law privacy and the Act's general exceptions to disclosure. *See Collins v. Tex Mall, L.P.*, 297 S.W.3d 409, 415 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2009, no pet.) (statutory provision controls and preempts common-law only when the statute directly conflicts with common law principle); *see also CenterPoint Energy Houston Elec. LLC v. Harris County Toll Rd.*, 436 F.3d 541, 544 (5th Cir. 2006) (common law controls only where there is no conflicting or controlling statutory law); Open Records Decision No. 451 at 4 (1986) (specific access provision prevails over generally applicable exception to public disclosure). Section 552.117 of the Government Code is a general exception to disclosure. Accordingly, the department may not withhold any of the submitted information from this requestor under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy or under section 552.117 of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit and a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1), (2). We agree portions of the submitted information are subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code. As previously noted, a statutory right of access generally prevails over the Act's general exceptions to disclosure. *See* ORD 451 at 4. However, because section 552.130 of the Government Code has its own access provisions, we conclude section 552.130 is not a general exception under the Act. We must address the conflict between the access provided under section 261.105 of the Family Code and the confidentiality provided by section 552.130 of the Government Code. Where information falls within both a general and a specific provision of law, the specific provision prevails over the general. *See Horizon/CMS Healthcare Corp. v. Auld*, 34 S.W.3d 887, 901 (Tex. 2000) ("more specific statute controls over the more general"); *Cuellar v. State*, 521 S.W.2d 277 (Tex. Crim. App. 1975) (under well-established rule of statutory construction, specific statutory provisions prevail over general ones). Although section 261.105(a) generally allows DFPS access to reports received by a local or state law enforcement agency that allege abuse or neglect by a person responsible for a child's care, custody, or welfare, section 552.130 specifically protects motor vehicle record information. We conclude section 261.105(a) does not provide DFPS access to information subject to section 552.130. Notwithstanding the provision of section 261.105(a) of the Family Code, the department

must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information to this requestor.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Neal Falgoust
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

NF/bhf

Ref: ID# 607664

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

²Because the requestor has a right of access to this information, the department must seek another ruling from this office if it receives another request for this same information from a different requestor.