



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

December 28, 2015

Mr. Michael B. Gary
Counsel for the City of Stafford
Olson & Olson, LLP
2727 Allen Parkway, Suite 600
Houston, Texas 77019-2133

OR2015-27087

Dear Mr. Gary:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 591842 (Ref. No. COS15-064).

The Stafford Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for a specified incident report. You state some of the requested information has been released. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure pursuant to sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.1175 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information includes court-filed documents subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a)(17) provides for the required public disclosure of "information that is also contained in a public court record" unless it is "made confidential under [the Act] or other law[.]" Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(17). Although you raise section 552.108 of the Government Code, this is a discretionary exception and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). Furthermore, although the department claims a portion of the information subject to section 552.022(a)(17) is protected by common-law privacy, we note information that has been filed with a court is not protected by common-law privacy. *See Star-Telegram v. Walker*, 834 S.W.2d 54 (Tex. 1992) (common-law privacy not applicable to court-filed

document). Therefore, the department may not withhold the court-filed documents, which we have marked, under section 552.108 of the Government Code or common-law privacy. As the department has not claimed any other exceptions to disclosure for this information, the department must release the marked court-filed documents.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i] nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime [if] release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706(Tex. 1977). You state release of the submitted information will interfere with a pending criminal investigation. Based on this representation, we conclude section 552.108(a)(1) is generally applicable in this instance. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). We note, however, the remaining information at issue includes a DIC-24 statutory warning and a DIC-25 notice of suspension. The department provided copies of these forms to the arrestee. You have not explained how releasing this information, which has already been seen by the arrestee, would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). Accordingly, the DIC-24 and DIC-25 forms may not be withheld under section 552.108(a)(1).

Additionally, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure “basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.” *Id.* § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic “front-page” information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-187; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Accordingly, with the exception of the information subject to section 552.022(a)(17), the DIC-24 and DIC-25 forms, and basic information, the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.¹

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must

¹Although basic information includes an arrestee’s social security number, section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person’s social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov’t Code § 552.147(b).

withhold the motor vehicle record information you marked in the DIC-24 and DIC-25 forms under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” This section encompasses common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. In considering whether a public citizen’s date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court’s rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees’ dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees’ privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure. *Texas Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens’ dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3. Thus, the department must withhold the public citizen’s date of birth you have marked in the DIC-24 form under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, the court filed documents we have marked must be released pursuant to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code. With the exception of the DIC-24 and DIC-25 forms and basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold the remaining submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.² In releasing the DIC-24 and DIC-25 forms, the department must withhold the public citizen’s date of birth you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy and the motor vehicle record information you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/>

²As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument for this information.

[orl_ruling_info.shtml](#), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in dark ink, appearing to read 'Debbie K. Lee', with a stylized, cursive script.

Debbie K. Lee
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

DKL/som

Ref: ID# 591842

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)