



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

October 20, 2015

Mr. Brad Bowman
General Counsel
Texas Department of Licensing and Regulation
P.O. Box 12157
Austin, Texas 78711-2157

OR2015-21982

Dear Mr. Bowman:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 583740 (TDLR #PIR-20150892).

The Texas Department of Licensing and Regulation (the "department") received a request for all information pertaining to a specified towing license. You indicate the department will redact motor vehicle record information pursuant to section 552.130(c) of the Government Code as well as personal e-mail addresses under section 552.137 of the Government Code pursuant to Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009).¹ You state the department will release some information but claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses laws that make criminal history record information ("CHRI") confidential. CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565

¹Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in subsection 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. See Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). See *id.* § 552.130(d), (e). Open Records Decision No. 684 is a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold certain categories of information, including an e-mail address of a member of the public under section 552.137 of the Government Code, without the necessity of seeking a decision from this office.

at 7 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* at 10-12. Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F or subchapter E-1 of the Government Code. *See* Act of May 27, 2015, 84th Leg., R.S., ch. 1279, § 21, 2015 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 4327, 4337 (Vernon) (to be codified as an amendment to Gov’t Code § 411.083(a)).

Sections 411.093 and 411.122 of the Government Code both provide the department is entitled to obtain from DPS CHRI that relates to a person who is a holder of a license issued by the department. *See* Gov’t Code §§ 411.093, .122. However, the department may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See* Act of May 27, 2015, 84th Leg., R.S., ch. 1279, § 21, 2015 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 4327, 4337 (Vernon) (to be codified as an amendment to Gov’t Code § 411.083(a)), § 411.084(c) (agency may not confirm existence or nonexistence of CHRI to any person not eligible to receive the information). Thus, any CHRI generated by the federal government or another state may not be made available to the requestor except in accordance with federal regulations. *See* ORD 565. Furthermore, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with chapter 411 of the Government Code. You state the information you marked consists of CHRI obtained from DPS regarding a licensee. Based on your representation and our review, we conclude the information at issue consists of confidential CHRI obtained by the department from DPS regarding a licensee. Therefore, the department must withhold the information you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with federal law and chapter 411 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. In considering whether a public citizen’s date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court’s rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees’ dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees’ privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.² *Texas Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens’ dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3. Thus, the department must

²Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure “information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy.” Gov’t Code § 552.102(a).

withhold all public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

As noted above, you have redacted some information pursuant to section 552.130(c) of the Government Code. We note the remaining information contains additional information subject to section 552.130 which provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See Gov't Code § 552.130.* Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you redacted, and the additional motor vehicle record information we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold the information you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with federal law and chapter 411 of the Government Code. The department must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common law privacy. The department must withhold the information you have redacted, and the additional information we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining submitted information must be released.

You ask this office to issue a previous determination that would permit the department to withhold CHRI under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with federal law and chapter 411 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. We decline to issue such a previous determination at this time. Accordingly, this letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Ramsey A. Abarca
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

RAA/dls

Ref: ID# 583740

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)