



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

October 7, 2015

Ms. Paige Mebane
Assistant City Attorney
City of Fort Worth
1000 Throckmorton Street, Third Floor
Fort Worth, Texas 76102

OR2015-21000

Dear Ms. Mebane:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 582185 (Fort Worth Request #W044365-072115).

The City of Fort Worth (the "city") received a request for records of law enforcement calls pertaining to a specified address, during a specified period of time. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 58.007 of the Family Code, which provides, in part:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c); *See* Act of June 1, 2015, 84th Leg., R.S., ch. 935, § 18, 2015 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 3224, 3233-34 (to be codified as amendments to Fam. Code § 51.03); Act of May 31, 2015, 84th Leg., R.S., ch. 944, § 4, 2015 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 3268, 3269-70 (to be codified as an amendment to Fam. Code § 51.03(b)); Act of June 1, 2015, 84th Leg., R.S., ch. 1273, § 3, 2015 Tex. Sess. Law. Serv. 4310, 4311 (to be codified as an amendment to Fam. Code § 51.03(b)) (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision” for purposes of section 58.007). Section 58.007(c) is applicable to records of juvenile conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997. The juvenile must have been at least 10 years old and less than 17 years of age when the conduct occurred. *See id.* § 51.02(2) (defining “child” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). Upon review, we find the submitted information involves alleged juvenile delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred after September 1, 1997. The exceptions in section 58.007 do not appear to apply. Therefore, this information is generally confidential under section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.

However, the submitted information indicates the requestor is a representative of a child-placing agency that is licensed by the Texas Department of Family Protective Services (“DFPS”) in accordance with chapter 42 of the Human Resources Code, and a resident of the specific address at issue is a prospective foster parent. *See generally* Hum. Res. Code ch. 42. Pursuant to rules promulgated by DFPS under chapter 42 of the Human Resources Code, child-placing agencies are required to complete a foster home screening prior to verifying a foster home. *See* Act of March 30, 2015, 84th Leg., R.S., ch.1, § 4.212, 2015 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 1, 779-780 (Vernon) (to be codified as amendments to Hum. Res. Code § 42.042(a), (e), (f)-(g)) (executive commissioner shall make rules to carry out provisions of chapter 42, including minimum standards for child-placing agencies, child-care services, licensed child-care facilities, and registered family homes). As part of the screening, the agency must obtain certain information as set forth at section 749.2447. 40 T.A.C. §§ 749.2445(c)(1), .2471(1); *cf.* Hum. Res. Code § 42.0561 (providing in part that “[b]efore . . . a child-placing agency may issue a verification certificate for an agency foster home, the . . . child-placing agency must obtain information relating to each family violence report at the applicant’s residence to which a law enforcement agency responded during the 12 months preceding the date of the application. The applicant shall provide the information on a form prescribed by the department.”). Section 749.2447(7) provides a

child-placing agency must obtain, document, and assess, in part, the following information about a prospective foster home:

The results of criminal history and central registry background checks conducted on the prospective foster parents[.] . . . With respect to law enforcement service call information, [the child-placing agency] *must do the following*:

(A) *Obtain service call information from the appropriate law enforcement agency for the prospective foster parents' addresses for the past two years. Discuss with the prospective foster parents any service call information that [the child-placing agency] obtain[s] from a law enforcement agency and the facts surrounding the incident.*

...

(C) *Assess and document information obtained from law enforcement and any discussion with the prospective foster parents in the foster home screening.*

Id. § 749.2447(7)(A), (C) (emphasis added); *see* 40 T.A.C § 749.2445(a); *see id.* §§ 745.21(8) (defining “child-placing agency”), (32) (defining “permit”), (33) (defining “permit holder”), 749.41(1) (defining “you” as applicant or permit holder), .43 (words and terms in chapter 749 have meanings assigned under section 745.21). Thus, section 749.2447(7) of title 40 of the Texas Administrative Code requires a child-placing agency to obtain all service call information for a two year period for service calls to the addresses of prospective foster parents from appropriate law enforcement agencies. *See id.* Accordingly, we find a child-placing agency licensed by DFPS under chapter 42 of the Human Resources Code has a right of access to this information under section 749.2447(7) when it is obtained for the purpose of verifying a prospective foster home pursuant to the requirements of section 749.2445.

In this instance, the requestor is seeking all service calls to a specified address for the previous two years. Accordingly, we conclude the requestor has a right of access to the submitted information pursuant to section 749.2447(7) of title 40 of the Texas Administrative Code. Therefore, we must address the conflict between the access provided under section 749.2447 and the confidentiality provided under section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. Where information falls within both a general and a specific statutory provision, the specific provision prevails over the general statute. *See Gov't Code* § 311.026 (where general statutory provision conflicts with specific provision, specific provision prevails as exception to general provision unless general provision is later enactment and manifest intent is that general provision prevails); *Cuellar v. State*, 521 S.W.2d 277 (Tex. Crim. App. 1975) (under well-established rule of statutory construction, specific

statutory provisions prevail over general ones). While section 58.007(c) generally makes juvenile law enforcement records confidential with respect to the general public, section 749.2447(7) requires release of information for a specified address and time period to a specified type of requestor in a certain circumstance — a child-placing agency verifying a foster home at that address. *See* Fam. Code § 58.007(c); 40 T.A.C. § 749.2447(7). Thus, the statutory right of access granted to the requestor by section 749.2447(7) of title 40 of the Texas Administrative Code prevails over the more general confidentiality provision of section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. Consequently, the city may not withhold the information at issue under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.

You also raise section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy for portions of the submitted information.¹ However, we note a specific statutory right of access prevails over the common law. *Collins v. Tex Mall, L.P.*, 297 S.W.3d 409, 415 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2009, no pet.) (statutory provision controls and preempts common law only when statute directly conflicts with common-law principle); *CenterPoint Energy Houston Elec. LLC v. Harris County Toll Rd.*, 436 F.3d 541, 544 (5th Cir. 2006) (common law controls only where there is no conflicting or controlling statutory law). Because the requestor, in this instance, has a statutory right of access to the information at issue, the city may not withhold any of the submitted information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code, which provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release.² *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(a). Upon review, we find the information we have marked consists of motor vehicle record information for purposes of section 552.130. Accordingly, this information is generally confidential under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

However, as previously noted, the requestor has a statutory right of access to the submitted information pursuant to section 749.2447(7) of title 40 of the Texas Administrative Code. We note a statutory right of access generally prevails over the Act's general exceptions to disclosure. *See* Open Records Decisions 613 at 4 (1993), 451 at 4 (1986). We conclude, however, because section 552.130 of the Government Code has its own access provisions,

¹Section 552.101 encompasses the common-law right to privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976).

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

section 552.130 is not a general exception under the Act. Therefore, we must address the conflict between the access provided under section 749.2447(7) and the confidentiality provided under section 552.130 of the Government Code. As noted above, where information falls within both a general and specific provision of law, the specific provision prevails over the general. *See* Gov't Code § 311.026; *Cuellar*, 521 S.W.2d 277. Although section 749.2447(7) generally allows a child-placing agency access to service call information, section 552.130 specifically protects motor vehicle record information. Thus, we find the confidentiality provided by section 552.130 is more specific than the right of access provided by section 749.2447(7). Accordingly, we conclude, notwithstanding the statutory right of access granted to the requestor by section 749.2447(7) of title 40 of the Texas Administrative Code, the city must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the city must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released pursuant to section 749.2447(7) of title 40 of the Texas Administrative Code.³

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Joseph Keeney
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JDK/dls

³Because the requestor has a special right of access to some of the information being released, the city must again seek a decision from this office if it receives another request for the same information from another requestor.

Ref: ID# 582185

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)