



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

September 23, 2015

Ms. Amy Monsivais
Assistant County Attorney
El Paso County Attorney's Office
500 East San Antonio, Room 503
El Paso, Texas 79901

OR2015-19887

Dear Ms. Monsivais:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 580225 (Ref. No. 0161-15-PI).

The El Paso County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for a specified incident report involving a named individual. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Generally, only the information that either identifies or tends to identify a victim of sexual assault or other sex-related offense may be withheld under common-law privacy. However, a governmental body is required to withhold an entire report when identifying information is inextricably intertwined with other releasable information or when the requestor knows the identity of the alleged victim. *See* Open Records Decisions Nos. 393 (1983), 339 (1982);

see also Open Records Decision No. 440 (1986) (detailed descriptions of serious sexual offenses must be withheld). In this instance, the requestor knows the identity of the alleged victim in the submitted offense report. Thus, withholding only the identifying information from the requestor would not preserve the victim's common-law right to privacy. Therefore, we conclude the submitted information is generally confidential in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

We note the requestor is a Judge Advocate with the United States Army and may have a right of access to some of the information that would otherwise be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code. Section 411.089(a) of the Government Code provides that “[a] criminal justice agency is entitled to obtain from the [Department of Public Safety] any criminal history record information maintained by the [Department of Public Safety] about a person.” *See* Gov't Code § 411.089(a). In addition, section 411.087(a) of the Government Code provides, in pertinent part:

(a) [a] person, agency, department, political subdivision, or other entity that is authorized by this subchapter or Supchapter E-1 to obtain from the [Department of Public Safety] criminal history record information maintained by the [Department of Public Safety] that relates to another person is authorized to:

...

(2) obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state criminal history record information maintained by that criminal justice agency that relates to that person.

Act of May 27, 2015, 84th Leg., R.S., ch. 1279, § 24, 2015 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 4327, 4337 - 4338 (Vernon) (to be codified as an amendment to Gov't Code § 411.087(a)(2)). We note that “criminal history record information” is defined as “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” *See id.* § 411.082(2). Thus, the submitted information in this instance contains “criminal history record information.” However, a criminal justice agency that receives criminal history record information from another criminal justice agency pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) may only receive such information for a criminal justice purpose. *See id.* §§ 411.083(c), .087(b); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 655 (1997) (discussing limitations on release of criminal history record information). Although this information is confidential under common-law privacy, a statutory right of access prevails over common-law privacy. *Collins v. Tex Mall, L.P.*, 297 S.W.3d 409, 415 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2009, no pet.) (statutory provision controls and preempts common law only when statute directly conflicts with common law principle); *CenterPoint Energy Houston Elec. LLC v. Harris County Toll Rd.*, 436 F.3d 541, 544 (5th

Cir. 2006) (common law controls only where there is no conflicting or controlling statutory law). Further, although you also claim this information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code, a specific statutory right of access prevails over general exceptions to disclosure under the Act. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exception to disclosure under the Act). Thus, to the extent the requestor represents a criminal justice agency, he is authorized to obtain the criminal history record information at issue from the sheriff's office pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code, but only for a criminal justice purpose. *See* Gov't Code §§ 411.083(c), Act of May 27, 2015, 84th Leg., R.S., ch. 1279, § 24, 2015 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 4327, 4337 - 4338 (Vernon) (to be codified as an amendment to Gov't Code § 411.087(a)(2)).

A "criminal justice agency" is defined in part as "a federal or state agency that is engaged in the administration of criminal justice under a statute or executive order and that allocates a substantial portion of its annual budget to the administration of criminal justice." *Id.* § 411.082(3)(A). "Administration of criminal justice" has the meaning assigned to it by article 60.01 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. *See id.* § 411.082(1). Article 60.01 of the Code of Criminal Procedure defines "administration of criminal justice" as the "performance of any of the following activities: detection, apprehension, pretrial release, post-trial release, prosecution, adjudication, correctional supervision, or rehabilitation of an offender. The term includes criminal identification activities and the collection, storage, and dissemination of criminal history record information." Crim. Proc. Code art. 60.01(1).

In this case, we cannot determine whether the requestor is a representative of a criminal justice agency and whether he intends to use the criminal history record information for a criminal justice purpose. Consequently, if the sheriff's office determines that this particular requestor is requesting the information on behalf of a criminal justice agency and intends to use the criminal history record information for a criminal justice purpose, we conclude the sheriff's office must make available to the requestor the criminal history record information from the documents that shows the type of allegation made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions. *See* Open Records Decision No. 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exceptions to disclosure under the Act). In that instance, the sheriff's office must withhold the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.¹

However, if the sheriff's office determines that this particular requestor is not requesting the information on behalf of a criminal justice agency or does not intend to use the criminal history record information for a criminal justice purpose, then the sheriff's office must

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure.

withhold the submitted information in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, the sheriff's office must generally withhold the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, to the extent that the requestor has a right of access to the criminal history record information in the report pursuant to subchapter F of Chapter 411 of the Government Code, the requestor is authorized to obtain that information in accordance with that chapter.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Meredith L. Coffman', with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

Meredith L. Coffman
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MLC/dls

Ref: ID# 580225

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)