



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

September 22, 2015

Ms. Sarah R. Martin
Assistant City Attorney
Arlington Police Department
Mail Stop 04-0200
P.O. Box 1065
Arlington, Texas 76004-1065

OR2015-19760

Dear Ms. Martin:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 580163 (APD Reference No. 22303).

The Arlington Police Department (the "department") received a request for any and all reports pertaining to a named individual. You claim the requested information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *See Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both elements of the test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find that a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. In this instance, the requestor seeks access to

unspecified law enforcement records relating to the named individual. Thus, this request requires the department to compile the named individual's criminal history and thereby implicates his right to privacy.¹

We note, however, the requestor is an investigator with the Texas Board of Nursing (the "board"). Section 411.125 of the Government Code provides:

The [board] is entitled to obtain from the [Department of Public Safety] criminal history record information maintained by the [Department of Public Safety] that relates to a person who:

- (1) is an applicant for or the holder of a license issued by the board;
- (2) has requested a determination of eligibility for a license from the board; or
- (3) is subject to investigation by the board in connection with a complaint or formal charge against the person.

Gov't Code § 411.125. In addition, section 411.087(a) of the Government Code provides, in pertinent part:

(a) Unless otherwise authorized by Subsection (e), a person, agency, department, political subdivision, or other entity that is authorized by this subchapter or Subchapter E-1 to obtain from the [Department of Public Safety] criminal history record information maintained by the [Department of Public Safety] that relates to another person is authorized to:

...

- (2) obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state criminal history record information maintained by that criminal justice agency that relates to that person.

Act of May 27, 2015, 84th Leg., R.S., ch. 1279, § 24, 2015 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 4327, 4337-4338 (Vernon) (to be codified as an amendment to Gov't Code § 411.087(a)(2)). "Criminal history record information" ("CHRI") is defined as "information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions." *See id.* § 411.082(2). Thus, under section 411.125, the

¹As we are able to make this determination, we need not address your remaining argument.

board may have a right of access to CHRI about the named individual contained in the department's records.

Accordingly, if the named individual is an applicant for a license from the board, a holder of a license from the board, has requested a determination of eligibility for a license from the board, or is subject to investigation by the board in connection with a complaint or formal charge, then, pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code, the requestor is authorized to obtain from the department CHRI relating to the named individual. *See id.* §§ 411.087(a)(2), .125(a). Thus, if any of these conditions is met, then the department must make available to the requestor any CHRI under section 411.087 and must withhold any remaining information, to the extent it exists, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. *See Collins v. Tex Mall, L.P.*, 297 S.W.3d 409, 415 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2009, no pet.) (statutory provision controls and preempts common law only when statute directly conflicts with common law principle); *CenterPoint Energy Houston Elec. LLC v. Harris County Toll Rd.*, 436 F.3d 541, 544 (5th Cir. 2006) (common law controls only where there is no conflicting or controlling statutory law). However, if the named individual does not meet any of the criteria of subsections 411.125(a)(1)-(3), then the board does not have a special right of access to any CHRI under section 411.087 of the Government Code. In that instance, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold such information in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Joseph Keeney
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JDK/dls

Ref: ID# 580163

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)