



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

September 9, 2015

Ms. Linda Pemberton
Paralegal
City of Killeen
P.O. Box 1329
Killeen, Texas 76540

OR2015-18781

Dear Ms. Pemberton:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 578494 (Killeen ID# W016568).

The Killeen Police Department (the "department") received a request for fifteen specified incident reports. You state you have released some information to the requestor. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A government body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state incident report numbers 15-00005960, 15-005769, and 15-005684 pertain to pending cases being prosecuted by Bell County Attorney's Office. You state the Bell County Attorney's Office objects to release of these reports. Additionally, you state the investigations for incident report numbers 15-006994, 15-006937, 15-005770, 15-006712, 15-006664, 15-006658, 15-006856, and 15-006540 have not been completed and are

pending. We note, however, the information at issue includes DIC-24 and DIC-25 statutory warnings. Copies of these forms were provided to the arrestees. We find you have not explained how releasing this information, which has already been provided to the arrestees, would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See* Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). Accordingly, the DIC-24 and DIC-25 forms may not be withheld under section 552.108. However, based on the submitted representations and our review, we conclude the release of the remaining information in incident report numbers 15-00005960, 15-005769, 15-005684, 15-006994, 15-006937, 15-005770, 15-006712, 15-006664, 15-006658, 15-006856, and 15-006540 would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the remaining information at issue.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . it is information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]” Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). Section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable only if the information at issue relates to a concluded criminal case that did not result in a conviction or a deferred adjudication. A governmental body that claims an exception to disclosure under section 552.108(a)(2) must reasonably explain how and why this exception is applicable to the information the governmental body seeks to withhold. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state incident report number 15-004364 pertains to a closed investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. Based on your representation, we agree section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code is applicable to this information.

Section 552.108 does not except from disclosure “basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.” Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic “front-page” information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-187; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Accordingly, with the exception of basic information and the DIC-24 and DIC-25 forms, the department may withhold (1) incident report numbers 15-00005960, 15-005769, 15-005684, 15-006994, 15-006937, 15-005770, 15-006712, 15-006664, 15-006658, 15-006856, and 15-006540 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code; and (2) incident report number 15-004364 of section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if (1) the information contains highly

intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both elements of this test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered highly intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. This office has found a compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987).

Generally, only highly intimate information implicating the privacy of an individual is withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, in certain instances, where it is demonstrated the requestor knows the identity of the individual involved, as well as the nature of certain incidents, the entire report must be withheld to protect the individual's privacy. In this instance, although you seek to withhold the entirety of incident report number 15-002852 under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy, we find this is not a situation in which the entirety of the information at issue must be withheld on the basis of common-law privacy. However, we find incident report number 15-002852 contains information which satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Therefore, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 411.083 of the Government Code which pertains to criminal history record information ("CHRI"). CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center ("NCIC") or by the Texas Crime Information Center ("TCIC") is confidential under federal and state law. CHRI means "information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions." Gov't Code § 411.082(2). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI obtained from the NCIC network or other states. *See* 28 C.F.R. § 20.21. The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990); *see generally* Gov't Code ch. 411 subch. F. Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Texas Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411,

subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. Upon review, we find the information we have marked constitutes CHRI, which the department must withhold under section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411 of the Government Code and federal law.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release.¹ *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Thus, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body," unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). *Id.* § 552.137(a)-(c). Accordingly, the department must withhold the e-mail address we have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owner of the address affirmatively consents to its release.

In summary, with the exception of basic information and the DIC-24 and DIC-25 forms, the department may withhold (1) incident report numbers 15-00005960, 15-005769, 15-005684, 15-006994, 15-006937, 15-005770, 15-006712, 15-006664, 15-006658, 15-006856, and 15-006540 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code; and (2) incident report number 15-004364 of section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy and chapter 411 of the Government Code and federal law. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the e-mail address we have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owner of the

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

address affirmatively consents to its release. The department must release the remaining information.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Abigail T. Adams".

Abigail T. Adams
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

ATA/akg

Ref: ID# 578494

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

²We note the information being released contains social security numbers. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. See Gov't Code § 552.147(b).