



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

July 13, 2015

Ms. Linda Pemberton
Paralegal
Office of the City Attorney
City of Killeen
P.O. Box 1329
Killeen, Texas 76540-1329

OR2015-14157

Dear Ms. Pemberton:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 571144 (City ID #W016167).

The Killeen Police Department (the "department") received a request for all records pertaining to a named individual. The department states it has released basic information for report numbers 13-005650, 02-012635, 08-016281, and 10-002717 pursuant to section 552.108(c) of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.108(c) (basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime is not excepted under section 552.108); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). The department claims the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions the department claims and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the

Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation. Id.* at 683. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Furthermore, we find that a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

The present request requires the department to compile unspecified law enforcement records concerning the named individual in the request. We find this request for unspecified law enforcement records implicates the named individual's right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must generally withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

However, the requestor is a representative from the United States Army (the "Army") and, thus, may have a right of access to some of the information at issue, to the extent it exists. The United States Department of Defense (the "DoD") is authorized to perform background investigations of persons seeking acceptance or retention in the armed services. *See* 5 U.S.C. § 9101(b)(1)(C); *see also id.* § 9101(a)(6)(A) (DoD is a covered agency for purposes of section 9101). The Army has a right to the criminal history record information ("CHRI") of state and local criminal justice agencies when its investigation is conducted with the consent of the individual being investigated. *See id.* § 9101(b)(1), (c); *see also* 10 U.S.C. § 111(b)(6) (DoD includes the Department of the Army). CHRI is defined as "information collected by criminal justice agencies on individuals consisting of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, indictments, informations, or other formal criminal charges, and any disposition arising therefrom, sentencing, correction supervision, and release" but does not include "identification information such as fingerprint records to the extent that such information does not indicate involvement in the criminal justice system" or "records of a State or locality sealed pursuant to law from access by State and local criminal justice agencies of that State or locality." 5 U.S.C. § 9101(a)(2).

Federal law provides the Army's right of access to CHRI preempts state laws. *Id.* § 9101(b)(4) (section 9101 "shall apply notwithstanding any other provision of law . . . of any State"). We conclude the Army's right of access under federal law preempts the state law at issue. *See English v. General Elec. Co.*, 496 U.S. 72, 79 (1990) (noting that state law is preempted to extent it actually conflicts with federal law); *see also La. Pub. Serv. Comm'n v. FCC*, 476 U.S. 355, 369 (1986) (noting a federal agency acting within scope of its congressionally delegated authority may preempt state regulation). Federal law, however, also provides the Army's right of access is contingent on the request being made for eligibility or retention purposes, and on receiving written consent from the individual under investigation for the release of such CHRI. *See* 5 U.S.C. § 9101(c).

In this instance, it is unclear if the individual whose information is at issue is seeking retention in the armed services and if the request is for retention purposes. Further, we have no indication the individual whose information is at issue provided the Army with a signed authorization for the release of the information at issue. Accordingly, if the request was for retention purposes, and the Army provides a signed written consent for release from the individual whose information is at issue, then to the extent the department maintains information listing the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must make available to the requestor the CHRI from such documents that shows the type of allegation made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions. *See Collins v. Tex Mall, L.P.*, 297 S.W.3d 409, 415 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2009, no pet.) (statutory provision controls and preempts common-law only when statute directly conflicts with common-law principle); *CenterPoint Energy Houston Elec. LLC v. Harris County Toll Rd.*, 436 F.3d 541, 544 (5th Cir. 2006) (common-law controls only where there is no conflicting or controlling statutory law). The department must withhold any remaining information, to the extent it exists, under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, if the request was not made for retention purposes, or if the Army does not provide a signed written consent for release, then, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records listing the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the requestor does not have a right of access to any CHRI. In that event, to the extent it exists, the department must withhold those records in their entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In either instance, we note the department has submitted reports that do not list the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. This information is not part of a criminal history compilation and, thus, does not implicate this individual's right to privacy. As such, the department may not withhold this information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on this basis. Accordingly, we will address the department's remaining arguments for this information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 58.007 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Fam. Code §58.007(c). Section 58.007(c) is applicable to law enforcement records of juvenile delinquent conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997. *See id.* § 51.03(a) (defining “delinquent conduct” for purposes of section 58.007). For purposes of section 58.007(c), “child” means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the reported conduct. *See id.* § 51.02(2). Report number 08-011598 pertains to a juvenile suspect who was ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the incident that is the subject of the submitted report. Further, the report involves juvenile delinquent conduct that occurred after September 1, 1997. The department does not inform us, and it does not appear, any of the exceptions in section 58.007 apply to the information at issue. Therefore, report number 08-011598 is confidential under section 58.007(c) of the Family Code and must be withheld in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code exempts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). The department states report number 13-005650 relates to an active criminal investigation and release of the information would interfere with that investigation. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Based on these representations and our review, we conclude the department may withhold report number 13-005650 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code exempts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(2), .301(e)(1)(A). The department states report numbers 02-012635, 08-016281, and 10-002717 pertain to investigations that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Based on these representations and our review, we conclude the department may withhold report numbers 02-012635, 08-016281, and 10-002717 under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

In summary, if the request was for retention purposes, and the Army provides a signed written consent for release from the individual whose information is at issue, then to the extent the department maintains information listing the named individual as a suspect,

arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must make available to the requestor the CHRI from such documents that shows the type of allegation made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions. In that event, the department must withhold any remaining information, to the extent it exists, under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, if the request was not made for retention purposes, or if the Army does not provide a signed written consent for release, then, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records listing the named individual as a suspect, arrested person, or criminal defendant, to the extent it exists, the department must withhold those records in their entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold report number 08-011598 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. The department may withhold report number 13-005650 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The department may withhold report numbers 02-012635, 08-016281, and 10-002717 under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Rahat Huq
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

RSH/som

Ref: ID# 571144

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)