



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

July 8, 2015

Ms. Judith N. Benton
Assistant City Attorney
City of Waco
Legal Services Department
P.O. Box 2570
Waco, Texas 76702-2570

OR2015-13787

Dear Ms. Benton:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 570483 (Waco In House Tracking Numbers LGL-15-117 and LGL-15-127).

The City of Waco (the "city") received two requests from different requestors for a specified police report. You state the city will release some information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.²

¹ Although the city did not raise sections 552.130 and 552.147 of the Government Code in your briefing to this office, we understand you to raise these sections based on your markings in the submitted documents. Additionally, we note you marked some information under section 552.108 of the Government Code in your submission regarding In House Tracking Number LGL-15-117 that you did not mark in the subsequent submission for In House Tracking Number LGL-15-127. Accordingly, we assume you no longer seek to withhold the additional marked information under section 552.108. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.301, .302.

² We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. We note because “the right of privacy is purely personal,” that right “terminates upon the death of the person whose privacy is invaded.” *Moore v. Charles B. Pierce Film Enters., Inc.*, 589 S.W.2d 489, 491 (Tex. Civ. App.—Texarkana 1979, writ ref’d n.r.e.); *see also Justice v. Belo Broadcasting Corp.*, 472 F. Supp. 145, 147 (N.D. Tex. 1979) (“action for invasion of privacy can be maintained only by a living individual whose privacy is invaded”) (quoting RESTATEMENT (SECOND) OF TORTS § 6521 (1977)); Attorney General Opinions JM-229 (1984) (“the right of privacy lapses upon death”), H-917 (1976) (“We are . . . of the opinion that the Texas courts would follow the almost uniform rule of other jurisdictions that the right of privacy lapses upon death.”); Open Records Decision No. 272 (1981) (“the right of privacy is personal and lapses upon death”). Accordingly, the city may not withhold any portion of the information at issue based solely on the privacy rights of a deceased individual. Upon review, we find no portion of the information at issue is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public concern. Accordingly, the city may not withhold any portion of the information at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.108(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the information at issue would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706, 710 (Tex. 1977). The city states the submitted information relates to a pending criminal investigation. Based on this representation, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177, 186-87 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (delineating law enforcement interests present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Accordingly, we find section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code is applicable in this instance, and the city may withhold the information you have marked in your submission for In House Tracking Number LGL-15-127 on that basis.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal

identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(a). Upon review, we find the city must withhold the information you and we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.147(a) of the Government Code excepts the social security number of a living individual from public disclosure. Gov't Code § 552.147(a). The city may withhold the social security number you have marked under section 552.147 of the Government Code.

In summary, the city may withhold the information you have marked in your submission for In House Tracking Number LGL-15-127 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The city must withhold the motor vehicle record information you and we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The city may withhold the social security number you have marked under section 552.147 of the Government Code. The city must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kristi L. Godden
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KLG/cz

Ref: ID# 570483

Enc. Submitted documents

c: 2 Requestors
(w/o enclosures)