



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

June 29, 2015

Ms. Lauren F. Crawford
First Assistant City Attorney
City of Bryan
P. O. Box 1000
Bryan, Texas 77805

OR2015-12952

Dear Ms. Crawford:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 569055.

The Bryan Police Department (the "department") received a request for any and all reports, documents, notes, photographs, videotapes, audiotapes, tape recordings, and statements regarding a named individual. You claim the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. This office has found a compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764

(1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. However, information that refers to an individual solely as a victim, witness, or involved person is not a compilation of the individual's criminal history and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis.

The present request requires the department to compile unspecified law enforcement records concerning the individual named in the request and implicates that individual's right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records listing the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, the department has submitted reports which do not list the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. This information does not consist of a compilation of the named individual's criminal history, and the department may not withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy on that basis.

This office has also concluded, generally, information which either identifies or tends to identify a victim of sexual assault or other sex-related offense may be withheld under common-law privacy; however, if the identifying information is inextricably intertwined with other releasable information, the governmental body is required to withhold the entire report. Open Records Decision No. 393 at 2 (1983); see Open Records Decision No. 339 (1982); see also *Morales v. Ellen*, 840 S.W.2d 519 (Tex. App.—El Paso 1992, writ denied) (identity of witnesses to and victims of sexual harassment was highly intimate or embarrassing information and public did not have a legitimate interest in such information); Open Records Decision No. 440 (1986) (detailed descriptions of serious sexual offenses must be withheld). Further, where the requestor knows the identity of the victim, the entire report must be withheld to protect the victim's privacy. In this instance, you seek to withhold the entirety of report number 14-0601312 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, you have not demonstrated, and we are not able to determine, the requestor knows the identity of the victim. Accordingly, the department may not withhold the entirety of this report under section 552.101 on that basis. Upon review, however, we find the identifying information of the alleged victim satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Thus, the department must withhold the identifying information of the alleged victim, which we have marked and indicated, in report number 14-0601312 under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act] and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Upon review, we find report number 13-0901096 was used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Accordingly, the information is within the scope of section 261.201 of the Family Code. You have not indicated the department has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information. Therefore, we assume no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, we conclude the department must withhold report number 13-0901096 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code.

You claim section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code for Exhibit C. Section 552.108(a)(2) excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: . . . (2) it is information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested). You state the remaining information in Exhibit C pertains to closed cases that did not result in convictions or deferred adjudications. Based on your representation, we agree section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to this information.

We note, however, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure “basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.” *Id.* § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). *See* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976)

(summarizing the types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of the basic information, the department may withhold the remaining information in Exhibit C under section 552.108(a)(2).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the Medical Practice Act (the "MPA"), which governs access to medical records. Occ. Code §§ 151.001-168.202. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides:

- (a) A communication between a physician and a patient, relative to or in connection with any professional services as a physician to the patient, is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.
- (b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.
- (c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Id. § 159.002. Information that is subject to the MPA includes both medical records and information obtained from those medical records. *See id.* §§ 159.002, .004. This office has concluded the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 487 at 3-4 (1988), 370 at 2 (1983), 343 at 1 (1982). We have further found when a file is created as a result of a hospital stay, all the documents in the file referring to diagnosis and treatment constitute physician-patient communications or "[r]ecords of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that are created or maintained by a physician." Open Records Decision No. 546 at 1 (1990). Upon review, we find the information we have marked consists of medical records subject to the MPA. Therefore, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 159.002 of the Occupations Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 411.153 of the Government Code, which provides, as follows:

- (a) A DNA record stored in the DNA database is confidential and is not subject to disclosure under [the Act].

(b) A person commits an offense if the person knowingly discloses to an unauthorized recipient information in a DNA record or information related to a DNA analysis of a sample collected under this subchapter.

(c) An offense under this section is a state jail felony.

(d) A violation under this section constitutes official misconduct.

Gov't Code § 411.153. A "DNA record" means the results of a forensic DNA analysis performed by a DNA laboratory. *See id.* § 411.141(6)-(7). "Forensic analysis" is defined as "a medical, chemical, toxicologic, ballistic, or other expert examination or test performed on physical evidence, including DNA evidence, for the purpose of determining the connection of the evidence to a criminal action." *See* Crim. Proc. Code art. 38.35(4); *see also* Gov't Code § 411.141(10) (providing that "forensic analysis" has meaning assigned by article 38.35). A "DNA database" means "one or more databases that contain forensic DNA records maintained by the director of [the Department of Public Safety ("DPS")]." Gov't Code § 411.141(5); *see id.* § 411.001(3).

The director of DPS is required to establish certain procedures for DNA laboratories. *See id.* §§ 411.142(h) (requiring director establish standards for DNA analysis), .144(a). Section 411.144 of the Government Code provides that a DNA laboratory conducting a forensic DNA analysis under subchapter G of chapter 411 shall comply with subchapter G and the rules adopted under subchapter G. *See id.* § 411.144(d); 37 T.A.C. §§ 28.81, .82 (describing minimum standards by which forensic DNA laboratory must abide); *see also* Gov't Code § 411.147(b). The director of DPS may release a DNA record in certain instances, including to a criminal justice agency for criminal justice or law enforcement purposes. *See* Gov't Code § 411.147(c).

Upon review, we find the information we have marked consists of records relating to DNA analyses of samples that appear to have been collected under subchapter G of chapter 411 of the Government Code. We note this information is contained in records of a criminal investigation and appears to be the result of forensic DNA analyses performed by a DNA laboratory in accordance with DPS regulations. Therefore, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.153 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses laws that make criminal history record information ("CHRI") confidential. CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* at 10-12. Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems

confidential CHRI the Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) of the Government Code authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for criminal justice purposes. *See id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Upon review, we find the information we have marked constitutes confidential CHRI. Thus, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or a personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov’t Code § 552.130(a). Upon review, we find the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked and indicated under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records concerning the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold report number 13-0901096 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. With the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the remaining information in Exhibit C under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 159.002 of the Occupations Code, section 411.153 of the Government Code, section 411.083 of the Government Code, and common-law privacy. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.¹

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/>

¹We note section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person’s social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. § 552.147(b).

[orl_ruling_info.shtml](#), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script, appearing to read "Joseph Keeney".

Joseph Keeney
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JDK/eb

Ref: ID# 569055

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)