



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

April 6, 2015

Mr. J. Eric Magee
Allison, Bass, & Magee, L.L.P.
Victoria County Sheriff's Office
402 West 12th Street
Austin, Texas 78701

OR2015-06511

Dear Mr. Magee:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 558798.

The Victoria County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office"), which you represent, received a request for five categories of information pertaining to incidents in which a law enforcement officer discharged a firearm, resulting in injury or death of a human from January 1, 2004, to present. You state that you will withhold motor vehicle record information and social security numbers under sections 552.130(c) and 552.147(b) of the Government Code, respectively.¹ You claim the remaining submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.137 of the Government

¹Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in subsection 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e). Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See id.* § 552.147(b).

Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information was the subject of a previous request for a ruling, in response to which this office issued Open Records Letter No. 2012-19122 (2012). We note the facts, laws, and circumstances have changed since the issuance of Open Records Letter No. 2012-19122, and it may not be relied on as a previous determination. *See* Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001) (so long as law, facts, and circumstances on which prior ruling was based have not changed, first type of previous determination exists where requested information is precisely same information as was addressed in prior attorney general ruling, ruling is addressed to same governmental body, and ruling concludes that information is or is not excepted from disclosure). Accordingly, we will consider your arguments against disclosure.

We also note portions of the submitted information were previously released in response to Open Records Letter No. 2012-19122. Section 552.007 of the Government Code provides if a governmental body voluntarily releases information to any member of the public, the governmental body may not withhold such information from further disclosure unless its public release is expressly prohibited by law or the information is confidential by law. *See* Gov't Code § 552.007; Open Records Decision No. 518 at 3 (1989); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 400 (1983) (governmental body may waive right to claim permissive exceptions to disclosure under the Act, but it may not disclose information made confidential by law). Accordingly, pursuant to section 552.007, the sheriff's office may not now withhold any previously released information unless its release is expressly prohibited by law or the information is confidential by law. Although you raise section 552.108 for portions of the submitted information, section 552.108 does not prohibit the release of information or make information confidential. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 177 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). Therefore, the sheriff's office may not now withhold any previously released information under section 552.108 of the Government Code. However, you also raise sections 552.101 and 552.137 of the Government Code for the submitted information. Sections 552.101 and 552.137 make information confidential under law; thus, we will address your arguments under these sections for the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. You raise section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 ("HIPAA") for portions of the information at issue. At the direction of Congress, the Secretary of Health and Human Services ("HHS") promulgated regulations setting privacy standards for medical records, which HHS issued as the Federal Standards for Privacy of Individually Identifiable Health Information. *See* 42 U.S.C. § 1320d-2 (Supp. IV 1998) (historical & statutory note); Standards for Privacy of Individually Identifiable Health Information, 45 C.F.R. Pts. 160, 164 ("Privacy Rule"); *see also* Attorney General Opinion JC-0508 at 2 (2002). These standards

govern the releasability of protected health information by a covered entity. *See* 45 C.F.R. pts. 160, 164. Under these standards, a covered entity may not use or disclose protected health information, excepted as provided by parts 160 and 164 of the Code of Federal Regulations. 45 C.F.R. § 164.502(a).

This office addressed the interplay of the Privacy Rule and the Act. Open Records Decision No. 681 (2004). In Open Records Decision No. 681, we noted section 164.512 of title 45 of the Code of Federal Regulations provides a covered entity may use or disclose protected health information to the extent such use or disclosure is required by law and the use or disclosure complies with and is limited to the relevant requirements of such law. *Id.*; *see* 45 C.F.R. § 164.512(a)(1). We further noted the Act “is a mandate in Texas law that compels Texas governmental bodies to disclose information to the public.” ORD 681 at 8; *see also* Gov’t Code §§ 552.002, .003, .021. Therefore, we held the disclosures under the Act come within section 164.512(a). Consequently, the Privacy Rule does not make information confidential for the purpose of section 552.101 of the Government Code. *See Abbott v. Tex. Dep’t of Mental Health & Mental Retardation*, 212 S.W.3d 648 (Tex. App.—Austin 2006, no pet.); ORD 681 at 9; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 478 at 2 (1987) (statutory confidentiality requires express language making information confidential). Because the Privacy Rule does not make confidential information that is subject to disclosure under the Act, the sheriff’s office may not withhold any portion of the information at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the Medical Practice Act (“MPA”), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code, which governs release of medical records. *See* Occ. Code §§ 151.001-168.202. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides, in relevant part:

- (a) A communication between a physician and a patient, relative to or in connection with any professional services as a physician to the patient, is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.
- (b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.
- (c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient’s behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Id. § 159.002(a)-(c). Information that is subject to the MPA includes both medical records and information obtained from those medical records. *See id.* §§ 159.002, .004. This office has concluded the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. You state the submitted information contains medical records subject to the MPA. Upon review, we find you have failed to demonstrate the submitted information contains records of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient or information obtained from those records. Therefore, the sheriff's office may not withhold any of the information at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code on the basis of the MPA.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses information in chapter 411 of the Government Code, which makes confidential criminal history record information ("CHRI") generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. Gov't Code § 411.083(a). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. *See Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990)*. The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual laws with respect to the CHRI it generates. *See id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the department maintains, except that the department may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See id.* § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from the department or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Thus, any CHRI generated by the federal government or another state may not be made available to the requestor except in accordance with federal regulations. *See ORD 565*. Furthermore, any CHRI obtained from the department or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. Upon review, we find the information we marked must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code. However, none of the remaining information is subject to section 552.101 in conjunction with section 411.083 and thus may not be withheld on this basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or

embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Generally, only highly intimate information that implicates the privacy of an individual is withheld. However, in certain instances, where it is demonstrated the requestor knows the identity of the individual involved as well as the nature of certain incidents, the entire report must be withheld to protect the individual's privacy.

In this instance, you seek to withhold the entirety of the information at issue under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, you have not demonstrated, nor does it otherwise appear, this is a situation in which the entirety of the information at issue must be withheld on the basis of common-law privacy. Accordingly, the sheriff's office may not withhold the information at issue in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. Upon review, we find the information we have marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundations*. Thus, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. We find the remaining information at issue is not highly intimate or embarrassing information or is of legitimate public interest. Therefore, none of the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body" unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). *See* Gov't Code § 552.137(a)-(c). We note the information at issue contains an e-mail address subject to section 552.137. Accordingly, we find the sheriff's office must withhold the personal e-mail address we marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owner affirmatively consents to its public disclosure.

In summary, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must also withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. Finally, the sheriff's office must also withhold the email address we have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owner affirmatively consents to its public release. The remaining information at issue must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Mili Gosar". The signature is fluid and cursive, with the first name "Mili" and last name "Gosar" clearly distinguishable.

Mili Gosar
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MG/bhf

Ref: ID# 558798

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)