



January 29, 2015

Ms. Michelle Freeland
Legal Assistant
Office of General Counsel
Texas Department of Public Safety
P.O. Box 4087
Austin, Texas 78773-0001

OR2015-01768

Dear Ms. Freeland:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 552080 (PIR No. 14-3633).

The Texas Department of Public Safety (the "department") received a request for information regarding a specified incident.¹ You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code.² We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses laws that make criminal history record information ("CHRI") confidential. CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law.

¹As you did not submit a copy of the request for information for our review, we take our description from your briefing to this office.

²We note, and you acknowledge, the department did not comply with section 552.301 of the Government Code in requesting this decision. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(b), (e). Nevertheless, because the exception you claim can provide a compelling reason to overcome the presumption of openness, we will consider your claimed exception for the submitted information. *See id.* §§ 552.007, .302, .352.

CHRI means “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” *Id.* § 411.082(2). Part 20 of title 28 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI obtained from the National Crime Information Center network or other states. *See* 28 C.F.R. § 20.21. The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). Section 411.083 of the Government Code makes CHRI the Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains confidential, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in subchapter F of chapter 411 of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI. However, a criminal justice agency may only release CHRI to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Thus, CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with subchapter F of chapter 411 of the Government Code. However, section 411.083 does not apply to active warrant information or other information relating to an individual’s current involvement in the criminal justice system. *Id.* § 411.081(b) (police department allowed to disclose information pertaining to person’s current involvement with criminal justice system). Further, CHRI does not include driving record information. *Id.* § 411.082(2)(B). Upon review, we find the information we have marked under chapter 411 constitutes confidential CHRI. Therefore, the department must withhold this information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with chapter 411 of the Government Code and federal law.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information made confidential by section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part, as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). The information we have marked consists of information used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected abuse under chapter 261 of the Family

Code. Accordingly, this information falls within the scope of section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for the purposes of this section as a person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1) (defining “abuse” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). As we have no indication the investigating agency has adopted a rule governing the release of this type of information, we assume that no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, and based on our review, we conclude the information we have marked is confidential pursuant to section 261.201 of the Family Code, and the department must withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.³

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683.

In Open Records Decision No. 393 (1983), this office concluded information that either identifies or tends to identify a victim of sexual assault or other sex-related offense must be withheld under common-law privacy. ORD 393 at 2; *see* Open Records Decision No. 339 (1982); *see also Morales v. Ellen*, 840 S.W.2d at 519 (Tex. App.—El Paso 1992, writ denied) (identity of witnesses to and victims of sexual harassment was highly intimate or embarrassing information and public did not have a legitimate interest in such information). We note because “the right of privacy is purely personal,” that right “terminates upon the death of the person whose privacy is invaded.” *Moore v. Charles B. Pierce Film Enters., Inc.*, 589 S.W.2d 489, 491 (Tex. App.—Texarkana 1979, writ ref’d n.r.e.); *see also Justice v. Belo Broadcasting Corp.*, 472 F. Supp. 145, 146-47 (N.D. Tex. 1979) (“action for invasion of privacy can be maintained only by a living individual whose privacy is invaded”) (quoting Restatement of Torts 2d); *see* Attorney General Opinions JM-229 (1984) (“the right of privacy lapses upon death”), H-917 (1976) (“We are . . . of the opinion that the Texas courts would follow the almost uniform rule of other jurisdictions that the right of privacy lapses upon death.”); Open Records Decision No. 272 (1981) (“the right of privacy is personal and lapses upon death”). Upon review, we find the information we have marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find no portion of the remaining information is highly intimate or of no legitimate public concern, and the

³As our ruling is dispositive for this information, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure.

department may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

We note some of the remaining information is subject to sections 552.1175 and 552.130 of the Government Code.⁴ Section 552.1175 protects the home address, home telephone number, emergency contact information, date of birth, social security number, and family member information of certain individuals, when that information is held by a governmental body in a non-employment capacity and the individual elects to keep the information confidential. *See* Gov't Code § 552.1175. We note section 552.1175 is also applicable to personal cellular telephone numbers, provided the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision No. 506 at 5-6 (1988). Section 552.1175 applies, in part, to "criminal investigators of the United States as described by article 2.122(a), Code of Criminal Procedure[.]" *Id.* § 552.1175(a)(7). The remaining information includes the cellular telephone number of an agent of the United States Naval Criminal Investigative Services that is not held by the department in an employment capacity. Thus, if the agent at issue is a criminal investigator of the United States as described by article 2.122(a) of the Code of Criminal Procedure and elects to restrict access to his information in accordance with section 552.1175(b), then the department must withhold the cellular telephone number we have marked under section 552.1175 if the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body. However, if the cellular telephone service is paid for by a governmental body, the agent is not a criminal investigator of the United States as described by article 2.122(a) or the agent does not elect to restrict access to his information in accordance with section 552.1175(b), then the department may not withhold the marked information under section 552.1175.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(a). We note section 552.130 is designed to protect the privacy of individuals, and the right to privacy expires at death. *See Moore*, 589 S.W.2d 489, 491; ORD 272 at 1. Upon review, we find the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with chapter 411 and federal law, section 261.201 of the Family Code, and common-law privacy. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. If the agent at issue is a criminal investigator of the United States as described by

⁴The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

article 2.122(a) of the Code of Criminal Procedure and elects to restrict access to his information in accordance with section 552.1175(b), then the department must withhold the cellular telephone number we have marked under section 552.1175 if the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kristi L. Godden
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KLG/cz

Ref: ID# 552080

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)