



January 15, 2015

Mr. Kipling D. Giles
Senior Counsel
Legal Services Division
CPS Energy
P.O. Box 1771
San Antonio, Texas 78296

OR2015-00837

Dear Mr. Giles:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 551457.

The City Public Service Board of the City of San Antonio d/b/a CPS Energy ("CPS Energy") received three requests from different requestors for information pertaining to request for proposals number 7000121976 for collection services. Although you take no position as to whether the submitted information is excepted under the Act, you state release of the submitted information may implicate the proprietary interests of Ability Recovery Services, L.L.C. ("ARS"); Account Control Technology, Inc. ("ACT"); Account Services USA ("ASUSA"); Assigned Credit Solutions ("ACSolutions"); Associated Credit Services ("ACServices"); CBCS; Credit Control Services ("CCS"); Credit Management Group ("CMG"); Credit Systems International, Inc. ("CSI"); Diversified Adjustment Service, Inc. ("DAS"); LJ Ross Associates ("LJR"); Penn Credit ("Penn"); Receivables Performance Management ("RPM"); Sarma Collections ("Sarma"); Teleperformance ARM ("TARM"); and The Affiliated Group ("TAG"). Accordingly, you state, and provide documentation showing, you notified ARS, ACT, ASUSA, ACSolutions, ACServices, CBCS, CCS, CMG, CSI, DAS, LJR, Penn, RPM, Sarma, TARM, and TAG of the request for information and of the right of each to submit arguments to this office as to why the submitted information should not be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception in the Act in certain

circumstances). We have received comments from CCS. We have reviewed the submitted information and the submitted arguments.

Initially, we note an interested third party is allowed ten business days after the date of its receipt of the governmental body's notice under section 552.305(d) to submit its reasons, if any, as to why information relating to that party should be withheld from public disclosure. *See id.* § 552.305(d)(2)(B). As of the date of this letter, we have not received comments from ARS, ACT, ASUSA, ACSolutions, ACServices, CBCS, CMG, CSI, DAS, LJR, Penn, RPM, Sarma, TARM, or TAG explaining why the submitted information should not be released. Therefore, we have no basis to conclude ARS, ACT, ASUSA, ACSolutions, ACServices, CBCS, CMG, CSI, DAS, LJR, Penn, RPM, Sarma, TARM, or TAG has a protected proprietary interest in the submitted information. *See id.* § 552.110; Open Records Decision Nos. 661 at 5-6 (1999) (to prevent disclosure of commercial or financial information, party must show by specific factual evidence, not conclusory or generalized allegations, that release of requested information would cause that party substantial competitive harm), 552 at 5 (1990) (party must establish *prima facie* case that information is trade secret), 542 at 3. Accordingly, CPS Energy may not withhold the submitted information on the basis of any proprietary interest ARS, ACT, ASUSA, ACSolutions, ACServices, CBCS, CMG, CSI, DAS, LJR, Penn, RPM, Sarma, TARM, or TAG may have in the information.

We now turn to CCS's arguments against disclosure of its information. CCS argues its information was supplied with the expectation of confidentiality. However, information is not confidential under the Act simply because the party submitting the information anticipates or requests that it be kept confidential. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 677 (Tex. 1976). In other words, a governmental body cannot, through an agreement or contract, overrule or repeal provisions of the Act. Attorney General Opinion JM-672 (1987); Open Records Decision Nos. 541 at 3 (1990) ("[T]he obligations of a governmental body under [the predecessor to the Act] cannot be compromised simply by its decision to enter into a contract."), 203 at 1 (1978) (mere expectation of confidentiality by person supplying information does not satisfy requirements of statutory predecessor to Gov't Code § 552.110). Consequently, unless the information falls within an exception to disclosure, CPS Energy must release it, notwithstanding any expectations or agreement specifying otherwise.

Next, CCS states portions of its information are excepted from disclosure under section 552.110 of the Government Code. Section 552.110 protects (1) trade secrets and (2) commercial or financial information the disclosure of which would cause substantial competitive harm to the person from whom the information was obtained. *See Gov't Code* § 552.110(a)-(b). Section 552.110(a) protects trade secrets obtained from a person and privileged or confidential by statute or judicial decision. *Id.* § 552.110(a). The Texas Supreme Court has adopted the definition of trade secret from section 757 of the Restatement of Torts, which holds a trade secret to be:

any formula, pattern, device or compilation of information which is used in one's business, and which gives him an opportunity to obtain an advantage over competitors who do not know or use it. It may be a formula for a chemical compound, a process of manufacturing, treating or preserving materials, a pattern for a machine or other device, or a list of customers. It differs from other secret information in a business . . . in that it is not simply information as to single or ephemeral events in the conduct of the business. . . . A trade secret . . . [It may] relate to the sale of goods or to other operations in the business, such as a code for determining discounts, rebates or other concessions in a price list or catalogue, or a list of specialized customers, or a method of bookkeeping or other office management.

RESTATEMENT OF TORTS § 757 cmt. b (1939); *see also Hyde Corp. v. Huffines*, 314 S.W.2d 776 (Tex. 1958). In determining whether particular information constitutes a trade secret, this office considers the Restatement's definition of trade secret as well as the Restatement's list of six trade secret factors.¹ RESTATEMENT OF TORTS § 757 cmt. b. This office must accept a claim that information subject to the Act is excepted as a trade secret if a *prima facie* case for the exception is made and no argument is submitted that rebuts the claim as a matter of law. *See* ORD 552 at 5. However, we cannot conclude section 552.110(a) is applicable unless it has been shown the information meets the definition of a trade secret and the necessary factors have been demonstrated to establish a trade secret claim. Open Records Decision No. 402 (1983). We note pricing information pertaining to a particular contract is generally not a trade secret because it is "simply information as to single or ephemeral events in the conduct of the business," rather than "a process or device for continuous use in the operation of the business." RESTATEMENT OF TORTS § 757 cmt. b; *see also Huffines*, 314 S.W.2d at 776; Open Records Decision Nos. 255 (1980), 232 (1979), 217 (1978).

Section 552.110(b) protects "[c]ommercial or financial information for which it is demonstrated based on specific factual evidence that disclosure would cause substantial

¹The Restatement of Torts lists the following six factors as indicia of whether information constitutes a trade secret:

- (1) the extent to which the information is known outside of [the company];
- (2) the extent to which it is known by employees and other involved in [the company's] business;
- (3) the extent of measures taken by [the company] to guard the secrecy of the information;
- (4) the value of the information to [the company] and [its] competitors;
- (5) the amount of effort or money expended by [the company] in developing the information;
- (6) the ease or difficulty with which the information could be properly acquired or duplicated by others.

RESTATEMENT OF TORTS § 757 cmt. b; *see also* Open Records Decision Nos. 319 at 2 (1982), 306 at 2 (1982), 255 at 2 (1980).

competitive harm to the person from whom the information was obtained[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.110(b). This exception to disclosure requires a specific factual or evidentiary showing, not conclusory or generalized allegations, that substantial competitive injury would likely result from release of the information at issue. *Id.*; *see also* ORD 661 at 5.

CCS asserts portions of its information constitute trade secrets under section 552.110(a) of the Government Code. Upon review, we conclude CCS has failed to establish a *prima facie* case that any portion of its information meets the definition of a trade secret. We further find CCS has not demonstrated the necessary factors to establish a trade secret claim for its information. *See* ORD 402. Therefore, CPS Energy may not withhold any of CCS’s information under section 552.110(a).

CCS further argues portions of its information consist of commercial information the release of which would cause substantial competitive harm under section 552.110(b) of the Government Code. Upon review, we find CCS has failed to demonstrate the release of any of its information would result in substantial harm to its competitive position. *See* Open Records Decision No. 661. Accordingly, CPS Energy may not withhold any of CCS’s information under section 552.110(b).

The remaining documents include information that is subject to section 552.136 of the Government Code.² Section 552.136 provides, “Notwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.” Gov’t Code § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining “access device”). This office has determined insurance policy numbers are access device numbers for purposes of section 552.136. Accordingly, CPS Energy must withhold the insurance policy numbers within the submitted information under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

We note some of the materials at issue may be protected by copyright. A custodian of public records must comply with the copyright law and is not required to furnish copies of records that are copyrighted. Open Records Decision No. 180 at 3 (1977). A governmental body must allow inspection of copyrighted materials unless an exception applies to the information. *Id.*; *see* Open Records Decision No. 109 (1975). If a member of the public wishes to make copies of copyrighted materials, the person must do so unassisted by the governmental body. In making copies, the member of the public assumes the duty of compliance with the copyright law and the risk of a copyright infringement suit.

In summary, CPS Energy must withhold the insurance policy numbers within the submitted information under section 552.136 of the Government Code. CPS Energy must release the

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

remaining information; however, any information that is subject to copyright may be released only in accordance with copyright law.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Claire V. Morris Sloan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CVMS/som

Ref: ID# 551457

Enc. Submitted documents

c: 3 Requestors
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Michael S. Kraft
General Counsel
Credit Control Services
Two Wells Avenue
Newton, Massachusetts 02459
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Frank Pep
Ability Recovery Services, L.L.P.
c/o Kipling D. Giles
Senior Counsel
Legal Services Division
CPS Energy
P.O. Box 1771
San Antonio, Texas 78296
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Michael Magarrell
Account Control Technology, Inc.
c/o Kipling D. Giles
Senior Counsel
Legal Services Division
CPS Energy
P.O. Box 1771
San Antonio, Texas 78296
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Dane Mazzitti
CBCS
Account Control Technology, Inc.
c/o Kipling D. Giles
Senior Counsel
Legal Services Division
CPS Energy
P.O. Box 1771
San Antonio, Texas 78296
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Laura Beam
Credit Systems International, Inc.
Account Control Technology, Inc.
c/o Kipling D. Giles
Senior Counsel
Legal Services Division
CPS Energy
P.O. Box 1771
San Antonio, Texas 78296
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Joshua Pryor
LJ Ross Associates
Account Control Technology, Inc.
c/o Kipling D. Giles
Senior Counsel
Legal Services Division
CPS Energy
P.O. Box 1771
San Antonio, Texas 78296
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Steve Fox
Assigned Credit Solutions
c/o Kipling D. Giles
Senior Counsel
Legal Services Division
CPS Energy
P.O. Box 1771
San Antonio, Texas 78296
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Carrie Finney
Credit Management Group
c/o Kipling D. Giles
Senior Counsel
Legal Services Division
CPS Energy
P.O. Box 1771
San Antonio, Texas 78296
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Lisa Lynch
Diversified Adjustment Service, Inc.
c/o Kipling D. Giles
Senior Counsel
Legal Services Division
CPS Energy
P.O. Box 1771
San Antonio, Texas 78296
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Stephen Powelson
Penn Credit
c/o Kipling D. Giles
Senior Counsel
Legal Services Division
CPS Energy
P.O. Box 1771
San Antonio, Texas 78296
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Jackie Frost
Sarva Collections
Account Control Technology, Inc.
c/o Kipling D. Giles
Senior Counsel
Legal Services Division
CPS Energy
P.O. Box 1771
San Antonio, Texas 78296
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Mike Korte
The Affiliated Group
Account Control Technology, Inc.
c/o Kipling D. Giles
Senior Counsel
Legal Services Division
CPS Energy
P.O. Box 1771
San Antonio, Texas 78296
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Keith Hendricks
Receivables Performance Management
c/o Kipling D. Giles
Senior Counsel
Legal Services Division
CPS Energy
P.O. Box 1771
San Antonio, Texas 78296
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Robert Rougeou
Teleperformance ARM
d/b/a Alliance One Receivables
Management
c/o Kipling D. Giles
Senior Counsel
Legal Services Division
CPS Energy
P.O. Box 1771
San Antonio, Texas 78296
(w/o enclosures)