



January 15, 2015

Ms. Lillian Guillen Graham  
Assistant City Attorney  
Office of the City Attorney  
City of Mesquite  
P.O. Box 850137  
Mesquite, Texas 75185-0137

OR2015-00834

Dear Ms. Graham:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 551200.

The City of Mesquite (the "city") received a request for six specified reports and all calls for service during a specified time period pertaining to a specified address. You state the city will release some information to the requestor. You further state the city will redact certain information pursuant to the previous determination issued to the city in Open Records Letter No. 2012-07334 (2012).<sup>1</sup> You claim portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't

---

<sup>1</sup>Open Records Letter No. 2012-07334 authorizes the city to withhold FBI numbers under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code without requesting a decision under the Act when requests for such numbers are not made by individuals or entities who are authorized to obtain them under chapter 411 of the Government Code.

Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 58.007 of the Family Code, which provides in pertinent part as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

...

(e) Law enforcement records and files concerning a child may be inspected or copied by a juvenile justice agency as that term is defined by Section 58.101, a criminal justice agency as that term is defined by Section 411.082, Government Code, the child, and the child's parent or guardian.

...

(j) Before a child or a child's parent or guardian may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (e), the custodian of the record or file shall redact:

...

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or other law.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c), (e), (j)(2). Section 58.007(c) is applicable to law enforcement records of juvenile delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred on or after September 1, 1997. *See id.* § 51.03(a)-(b) (defining "delinquent conduct" and "conduct indicating a need for supervision" for purposes of section 58.007). For purposes of section 58.007(c), "child" means a person who is ten years of age or older

and under seventeen years of age at the time of the reported conduct. *See id.* § 51.02(2). The submitted information involves a child engaged in delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred after September 1, 1997. Thus, this information constitutes juvenile law enforcement records that are confidential pursuant to section 58.007(c). In this instance, however, we note the requestor is a parent of the juvenile suspect. Therefore, the submitted information may not be withheld from this requestor under section 58.007(c). *See id.* § 58.007(e) (law enforcement records concerning a child may be inspected or copied by the child's parent or guardian). However, section 58.007(j)(2) provides information subject to any other exception to disclosure under the Act or other law must be redacted. *Id.* § 58.007(j)(2). Accordingly, we will address your remaining arguments against disclosure.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses laws that make criminal history record information ("CHRI") confidential. CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. CHRI means "information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions." Gov't Code § 411.082(2). Part 20 of title 28 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI obtained from the National Crime Information Center network or other states. *See* 28 C.F.R. § 20.21. The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). Section 411.083 of the Government Code makes CHRI the Texas Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains confidential, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in subchapter F of chapter 411 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI. However, a criminal justice agency may only release CHRI to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Thus, CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with subchapter F of chapter 411 of the Government Code. Upon review, we find the information you have marked constitutes confidential CHRI. Therefore, the city must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be demonstrated. *See id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. However, we note the public has a legitimate interest in knowing the general details of a crime. *See generally* *Lowe v. Hearst Communications, Inc.*, 487 F.3d 246, 250 (5th Cir. 2007)

(noting a “legitimate public interest in facts tending to support an allegation of criminal activity” (citing *Cinel v. Connick*, 15 F.3d 1338, 1345–46 (1994))); *Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d at 186–87 (public has legitimate interest in details of crime and police efforts to combat crime in community); *see also* Open Records Decision Nos. 611 at 1 (1992) (family violence is a crime, not a private matter). Upon review, we find none of the information you marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the information at issue is not confidential under common-law privacy, and the city may not withhold it under section 552.101 on that basis.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or a personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov’t Code § 552.130(a). Upon review, we find the city must withhold the motor vehicle record information you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.147 of the Government Code provides that “[t]he social security number of a living person is excepted from” required public disclosure under the Act. *Id.* § 552.147(a). Therefore, the city may withhold the social security numbers you have marked under section 552.147(a) of the Government Code.

In summary, the city must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code. The city must withhold the motor vehicle record information you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The city may withhold the social security numbers you have marked under section 552.147(a) of the Government Code. The city must release the remaining information.<sup>2</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/>

---

<sup>2</sup>We note the requestor has a special right of access to some of the information being released. *See* Fam. Code § 58.007(e); Gov’t Code § 552.023(a) (person or person’s authorized representative has special right of access to information held by governmental body that relates to person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect person’s privacy interests); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning himself).

[orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](#), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Lauren Dahlstein  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

LMD/som

Ref: ID# 551200

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)