



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

November 5, 2012

Mr. Richard Bilbie
Assistant City Attorney
City of Harlingen
P.O. Box 2207
Harlingen, Texas 78551

OR2012-17639

Dear Mr. Bilbie:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 474131.

The Harlingen Police Department (the "department") received a request for incident report number 2012-00088244. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.103, and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. You raise section 552.101 in conjunction with section 58.007 of the Family Code. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997 are confidential under section 58.007(c), which provides as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). For purposes of section 58.007(c), a "child" is defined as a person ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the reported conduct. *Id.* § 51.02(2)(A). Section 58.007(c) is not applicable to information that relates to a juvenile as a complainant, victim, witness, or other involved party; it is only applicable to juveniles listed as suspects or offenders. *See id.* §§ 58.007, 51.03 (defining "delinquent conduct" and "conduct indicating a need for supervision" for purposes of section 58.007). Upon review, we find the submitted information does not identify a juvenile suspect or offender for purposes of section 58.007. Accordingly, we conclude you have not demonstrated the applicability of section 58.007(c) of the Family Code to the information at issue. Consequently, the department may not withhold the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007 of the Family Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides in part:

(a) Except as provided by Section 261.203, the following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act] and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

- (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and
- (2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency, other than the [Texas Department of Family and Protective Services] or the Texas Youth Commission, on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

(l) Before a child or a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (k), the custodian of the record or file must redact:

...

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or other law[.]

Id. § 261.201(a), (k), (l)(2). Upon review, we find the submitted information was used or developed in a child abuse investigation under chapter 261 of the Family Code, so as to fall within the scope of section 261.201(a). *See id.* § 261.001(1)(E) (definition of “child abuse” includes sexual assault under Penal Code section 22.011); *see also* Penal Code § 22.011(c)(1) (defining “child” for purposes of Penal Code section 22.011 as person under 17 years of age). Thus, the submitted report is generally confidential under section 261.201 of the Family Code. In this instance, however, the requestor is a parent of the child victim listed in the submitted report and is not suspected to have committed the alleged abuse. Therefore, the department may not withhold the submitted report from this requestor under section 261.201(a). Fam. Code § 261.201(k). However, section 261.201(l)(2) states that before a parent may inspect or copy a record concerning the child, any information that is excepted from required disclosure under the Act or other law may still be withheld from disclosure. *Id.* § 261.201(l)(2). Accordingly, we will consider your remaining arguments under sections 552.101, 552.103, and 552.108 of the Government Code for the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The type of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children,

psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. We note, however, the requestor is a parent of the minor child whose private information is at issue and, therefore, has a special right of access to information that would ordinarily be withheld to protect the minor's privacy interests. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(b) (governmental body may not deny access to person or person's representative to whom information relates on grounds that information is considered confidential under privacy principles). Therefore, the submitted information may not be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime [if] release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" *Id.* § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the submitted information relates to an active criminal investigation. Based on this representation, we conclude the release of this information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976).

Section 552.108 does not except from disclosure "basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime." Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic "front-page" information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle* and includes a detailed description of the offense. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-187; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.¹

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure, except to note basic information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle* is generally not excepted from public disclosure under section 552.103 of the Government Code. Open Records Decision No. 597 (1991). Because the requestor has a right of access to the information being released in this instance, if the department receives another request for this information from a different requestor, then the department should again seek a decision from this office.

responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, consisting of several overlapping, sweeping strokes that form a stylized representation of the name Ana Carolina Vieira.

Ana Carolina Vieira
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

ACV/ag

Ref: ID# 474131

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)